

Annexure I

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			DEA ,that this municipality is in desperate need of investment of the magnitude proposed by Atha Africa to address the needs of poverty eradication, unemployment, improvement of medical facilities, infrastructure and advancement of rural development, thus it has been encompassed in our IDP as one of the anchor projects . Should you require further information you may contact the Manager LED, Mr M G Nyembe at 017-7346305 Yours faithfully P B MALEBYE MUNICIPAL MANAGER			
December	Khambule	Volkstrust Library	Job Opportunity		Note that Atha can only embark on the appointment of contractors and employees after the project has been authorised.	Mine authorization process is underway
Caroline	Lötter (Natural Scientific Services)	Email	COMMENTS ON THE AMENDED ATHA YZERMYN COAL MINE EIA REPORT As a registered Interested and Affected Party, and having performed the initial floral, faunal, wetland and aquatic ecological specialist assessments for the proposed ATHA Yzermyn Coal Project (AYCP), Natural		The report was included as is. None of the information was discounted , but the evidence provided by NSS informed decision making towards an improved understanding of the project. These informed decisions reduced the potential impacts on the environment by a) changing the	Noted

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			Scientific Services (NSS) hereby asserts that our numerous concerns about the impact of the AYCP on biodiversity, as described in our AYCP "Biodiversity Baseline and Impact Assessment Report" dated September 2013, remain as is.		location of various activities b) changing the activities itself which resulted in a reduced footprint and a significantly reduced impact on the environment as was the intention of impact assessments.	
			In addition/In particular, we are concerned that: the Introduction to the "UPDATED Environmental and Social Impact Assessment Report and Environmental and Social Management Programme" (DEA Reference – 14/12/16/3/3/2/693) is distinctly skewed towards highlighting the supposed "need, desirability and National Interest" of the AYCP. We think the report needs to be amended to include a thorough discussion on the impact of coal mining on the environment and biodiversity in South Africa, and especially Mpumalanga, as recently discussed by e.g., Colvin & Burns 2011 (http://www.wwf.org.za/?4981/coalwater), Dabrowski & De Klerk 2013 (http://researchspace.csir.co.za/dspace/h		As an initial contributor to the ESIA report, the I and AP had EVERY opportunity to highlight these issues in their own contribution to the report. If at the time there was no need to include it as part of a study that had a greater impact on the environment, calling for this as a requirement after the fact and focusing on surface coal mining as regarded as irrelevant to the decision making process. Having said that, if the I and AP feels strongly about this, they are welcome to contribute the relevant clauses and this will be included in the response. At the time that EcoPartners was appointed, we did engage with NSS from the start, they had ample opportunity to bring these issues to the table. They were	Noted

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			<p>andle/10204/7614), Cronje et al. 2014 (http://www.benchmarks.org.za/research/policy_gap_9.pdf) and Davies 2014 (http://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2014-09-15-groundup-mpumalanga-environmental-crisis-why-is-nobody-listening/#%2EVBgHa2AcTIV) – to list but a few pertinent references. There also needs to be a decent discussion on the impact of coal mining on global warming and climate change.</p>		<p>also one of the first I and APs to access the website and were the very last to comment. These issues could have been highlighted and each one responded on individually, they chose not to.</p>	
			<p>Although a more comprehensive predictive ground water model was developed for the amended AYCP EIA report, there are still inherent assumptions and limitations to the model and, therefore, results from the model should be treated with caution. The established connectivity between the shallow weathered and deeper fractured aquifers means that significant mine de-watering could have a devastating impact on affected wetlands (specifically the springs), aquatic ecosystems (baseflow to the</p>		<p>We acknowledge the concerns about the ground water model accuracy and agree with the precautionary principle. It is accepted practice to run these models as conservatively as possible due to the low levels of accuracy and it can be accepted that this is reflecting the worst case. The models will be validated regularly and management interventions implemented as the mining progress, as is the commitment in the EMP. It is important to note that the specialist team has visited other mining operations in the</p>	<p>Noted</p>

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			Assegai River) and the biodiversity that these support, including many conservation important species “The ensuing cone of dewatering due to mine inflows will capture groundwater, which would have otherwise contributed to spring discharges, leakages along hill slopes, wetlands, river baseflow or to deeper regional groundwater flow.”		same geological formation and no indication was found during observation on these mines that the connectivity between the water table in the vados zone and the deep groundwater is significant and leading to large scale disruption of the wetlands in the area. even the historic mining sites near the proposed project shows virtually no inflows into the old workings. We will proceed with caution and regularly validate the models to ensure early response to any un-predicted impacts.	
			Although the tables in the wetland report do list the following two impacts from the de-watering, o Formation of groundwater cone of dewatering, leading to reduced recharge of wetland resources		Part of the mitigation for the impact on the wetlands will be using artificial recharge mechanisms. We accept that some impact will occur on the wetlands, but that this is small enough to be acceptable if balanced against the bigger picture of the mine development and the positive regional socio-economic impact.	Noted
			o Dewatering of wetland habitat down gradient of mining activities, leading to loss of water within wetland		We shall address this in the executive summary. The opinion of the specialists is that the wetlands will not be	Noted

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			habitat and altered hydrological patterns the impact is not highlighted in the executive summary or the text as being of significance.		dried out completely and would recover after mining has stopped as the water tables rebound.	
			The mitigation measures for this impact also refer to those from the groundwater report, however no specific mitigation measures are highlighted in this report for this impact. This impact, together with the impact of the decant, should both make the project unfeasible if not mitigated efficiently. In our opinion, this impact alone, cannot justify the short-term economic gains of the AYCP.		We appreciate your opinion on this matter, but as stated the effective mitigation can be used to ensure that the short-term gains and the long term impacts be addressed.	It may also be noted that the best environmental option provided in the report now is devoid of wash plant and discard dump.
			No biodiversity assessment work was performed for the main access route and other servitudes that will be utilized, upgraded or developed for the AYCP.		Increased road traffic was addressed in the traffic impact assessment. No Power line servitudes will be needed. The initial report completed by yourselves did cover the entire area.	Noted
			The planned surface infrastructure and underground mining (involving noise, vibrations and blasting), would be situated only a few hundred meters away from historical adits containing large numbers of conservation important and other		The mining will be more than 1km from the bats. It is an underground mine, therefore blasting noise and vibration will be very small with no felt vibrations expected that far from the mining operation. the mining will also be moving	Noted

Name	Surname	Comment received via	Comment	Date	EAP Response	Applicant Response
			bat species. Please provide an explicit discussion on this important biodiversity impact of the AYCP in the EIA report introduction.		progressively away from the historic mining sites, reducing any of the impacts even further over time. The historic mines will also be a no-go area.	
			We will wait in patient anticipation to review the final AYCP EIA report. Kind regards Caroline Lötter for Natural Scientific Services			
Donald	Khauhel o	email	I AM DONALD LEBAMBO FROM VOLKRUST I WOULD LIKE TO APPLY FOR THE JOB IN YZERMYN UNDERGROUND COAL MINE. I AM FULLY CRANE OPERATOR AND I HAVE A LOTS OF EXPIRIENCE.MAY YOU PLEASE MAM OR SIR GIVE ME SOME INFORMATION REGARDING TO APPLY FOR THE JOB IN YZERMYN OR FAX NUMBER WERE TO FAX A CV TO. MY NUMBER IS 0719002813 MY EMAIL IS donaldd4g@gmail.com I will appreciated your respond regarding any information.		Thank you for your comments. Note that Atha can only embark on the appointment of contractors and employees after the project has been authorised.	Mine authorization process is underway
Kathleen	Saunders	email	Dear Eumari, Our concerns remain unchanged and unaddressed in the review. The amendments do not significantly change		It is the opinion of the independent environmental practitioner to that the impact of the Yzermyn Underground Coal	Proper mitigation measures have been identified and incorporated in the report.